

**National Organic Standards Board (NOSB)**  
**Executive Committee Minutes**  
Friday, February 10, 2006, 12 noon EST

**Attendees:** Officers: Kevin O'Rell (Chair), Bea James (Secretary), and Andrea Caroe (Vice-Chair, CAC),  
**Members:**, Rigo Delgado (Policy Development), Michael Lacy (Livestock), Gerald Davis (Crops) and Julie Weisman (Handling),

**Sitting in:** Kevin Engelbert, Jeffrey Moyer, Daniel Giacomini, Jennifer Hall, and Hue Karreman

**Absent:** Nancy Ostiguy (Materials),

**Staff:** Katherine Benham, Valerie Frances, and Arthur Neal,

**Agenda:**

1. Call to Order - Kevin
2. Approve agenda - all
3. Secretary's report - Jan EC Minutes - Bea
4. Chair's report - Kevin
  - a. Open Board position
  - b. NOSB Calendar
  - c. Committee Recommendations for April meeting (Action Items)
5. NOP update – Katherine Benham, Mark Bradley, Valerie Frances, & Arthur Neal
  - a. April meeting update - status, logistics
  - b. Livestock Materials Proposed Rule - status
  - c. Pasture ANPR
  - d. Harvey Rule proposed change - whole herd conversion (June 4th deadline)
  - e. Crops - Processing Final Rule status
  - f. Sunset Timeline / ANPR
  - g. Syn/non-syn NOSB recommendation - status
  - h. Aquaculture Report - posting and next steps
6. Policy Development Committee report - Rigo
  - a. NOSB 101 guide (Bea & Rigo) - status
  - b. 606 criteria (commercial availability) and procedures - w/ HC
7. Materials Committee - Nancy
  - a. Sunset review plan - deferred materials list
  - b. New petitioned materials
8. Livestock Committee - Michael
  - a. Pasture Symposium
  - b. Sunset review
  - c. Avian Influenza Recommendation
  - d. Whole herd conversion
9. Handling Committee - Julie
  - a. Sunset Review
  - b. Ag/non-ag rec'd revisions (collaboration document with NOP)
10. Crops Committee - Gerald
  - a. Sunset review
  - b. Compost recommendation
  - c. Temporary research variance
  - d. Hydroponics
11. Certification, Accreditation, and Compliance Committee - Andrea
  - a. Policy Items for Certifiers
  - b. Peer Review Program Recommendation - low priority
12. Other business - all
13. Adjourn - all

Conversation regarding deferred materials as to whether it is an up-to-date before meeting had quorum– may not be?

**1. Call to Order – KO: 12:05pm**

**2. Approve agenda – moved and seconded as written, accepted**

**3. Secretary's report**

BJ: Jan EC Minutes; accurate attendee count, did we get everyone? BJ motioned, AC second; accepted

**4. Chair's report**

a. Open Board position

KO: NOP is looking through prior nominations? Any word?

VF: no timeline, yet, Secretary's call at this point

b. NOSB Calendar

KO: Thankful to BJ & VF for pulling together calendar.

VF: More details and target dates are welcome, i.e. RD's calendar of target dates shared before meeting, if anyone would like to incorporate more detail to share

c. Committee Recommendations for April meeting (Action Items)

KO: self-imposed deadline of March 17<sup>th</sup>

VF: Deadline is needed for KB to get the agenda into the federal register notice 15 days prior to meeting

**5. NOP update:**

a. April meeting update

KB: Status, logistics: Hotel reservations are made, already have names on list, NOSB members provide credit card to hotel for courtesy only, USDA pays, Ramada Conference Center, State College, PA, everything is set and ready to go, KB will forward pre-travel docs so that flights can get scheduled, court reporter set. Meeting space: Symposium, ACA training & Board meetings will all be in larger room. Is additional breakout room for meeting space for orientation needed, i.e. separate conference room with round table can be available? Please let her know. Arrival on the 17<sup>th</sup>; check-out either on 21<sup>st</sup> or 22<sup>nd</sup> depending on where you live and if you are attending ACA training, let Katherine know check-in and check-out dates, certifier training is on the 21<sup>st</sup> & all are invited – 18<sup>th</sup> New Member orientation, Board Meeting is 19 & 20<sup>th</sup>, 17<sup>th</sup> is for travel, if you live close by – driving, train, rent a car – she needs to know b/c she has to write up justification – last date to know about traveling reservations – end of March, On-line to set up your profile, reimbursements – finance has the information,

HK: Do older members need to attend New Member orientation session?

KO: would be a really rapport building, mentoring and coaching opportunity as well,

KB: spoken to out-going members – all will be attending – need to set-up an appreciation event, KO, VF & KB will work on that;

KB: What about a reception for the NOSB?

KO: Thinking the night after the symposium, Tuesday evening,

KB: Who pays has not been resolved but will help coordinate, if on-site

b. Livestock Materials Proposed Rule – status

AN: Office of General Counsel (OGC) is still reviewing 6517d3 – National List cannot include items in food, medications are not approved for use in food animals

HK: Hopes AMDUCA of 1996 is being included in thinking, a series of congressional actions to relieve the pain and suffering of food animals, FDA oversees

AN: Do not expect them to not say OK, just that they have to research and come up with a complete and informed review

c. Pasture ANPR

AN: Currently being revised – still out by this month, early January’s version was not accepted, Mark Bradley & Barbara Robinson are revising.

HK: Can we be involved?

AN: no, it is based on your input, no further input is required

d. Harvey Rule Proposed Change (June 4th deadline)

KO: whole herd conversion to be included?

AN: The response will be to do only what the court is requiring – will not try to deal with anything else because it is too complicated and will prevent us from meeting the court’s deadline; The only intention beyond dealing with Harvey is to follow the NOSB recommendations on that issue. In Harvey, also will include 606 changes – also require some more consultation and NOP needs to see what NOSB will recommend to meet court’s requirement

KO: NOSB waiting on NOP – what is needed? PDC/HC was in a quandary from last meeting

JW: Not clear whether expedited process will need to be in 606 or not?

AN: That’s a congressional amendment, not a court order,

VF: Need to have joint committee call and continue that discussion regarding NOSB criteria for 606 petitions and certifier guidance, that will satisfy the court

e. Crops-Processing Final Rule status

AN: still at OGC

f. Sunset Timeline ANPR

AN: Have not started, but goal is still August

g. Syn/Non-syn NOSB Recommendation Status

VF: Technical consultant group (ICF consulting) has drafted some comments, their info is looking helpful, and we have requested more information, not yet complete.

h. Aquaculture Report - Posting and Next Steps

AN: Report is posted on website. Livestock Committee needs to officially accept report and recommend that NOSB accept report as an Action item, NOP will receive and post comments by April 10<sup>th</sup>, George Lockwood, Chair of Aquaculture Task Force can be brought in to do a presentation;

VF: in similar vein, Pet Food Task Force (Handling Committee concern) – may also have a report to accept and may also need an official recommendation. Still have more work to do and they are working towards March 1<sup>st</sup> deadline, but just giving a heads up.

AC: Wild Caught? This has not been addressed by the group?

AN: Not enough well-rounded interest or call for this yet, not ready to deal with it, if a group can be pulled together that is as diverse, don’t want to have a report just get beat down, we want a good work product – not necessarily a deadline by congress. This Aquaculture report begins to address wild caught issues and may open the door for more quality effort

i. Executive Director’s Role

BJ: requested, but did not have time to discuss, (see end of meeting minutes for next steps)

KO moved up livestock committee agenda items at this time to discuss Pasture Symposium in case we run out of time and members have to leave call – no objection

**8. Livestock Committee**

a. Pasture Symposium

ML: working on pulling together Pasture Symposium input– talking to people around the country on nutritional aspects, appreciated VF pulling together NRCS people since they have the sensitivity

KO: Savory/Holistic Management International (pasture management research) would also like to participate and figuring out they would send: Hartman Group (consumer research group), would also like to see animal nutritionists

VF: NRCS has offered to include animal/dairy nutrition people as well

ML: dairy nutritionists, animal behaviorists, grazing, consumer, farmer input without going down the same road we have gone before – different and unique input

BJ: structure and outline for speakers, not as emotional, factual hands on testimony

KO: wants balance on farmer panel

VF: NOP will be the final inviters and deciders as to who is on panel

BJ: does this mean that individuals could be deleted, how will this work?

AN: seeking recommendations from the committee, perhaps 3 panels

ML: actually, thinking 4 panels: \*dairy, nutritional science, animal behaviorists; \*pasture & resource management; \*consumer researchers; \*farmers; Need to get it on paper

KO: Afternoon is what is scheduled following orientation with carryover the next morning.

HK: questions and answers from NOP and NOSB, what about audience?

ML: take some questions from audience – via cards, not verbal stand-up questions

KO: clear process, no grandstanding, relevant, not repeat

ML: Next call – check in with Barbara – b/c she indicated before that NOSB should make the recommendations

b. Sunset review

ML: good, hope to get it all approved last meeting, no problem with any materials, must discuss at next meeting – would it be possible to get a hold of 4-5 old TAP reviews

AN: a number are posted in archived areas on website, but we can find others as needed.

KO: Request that committee chairs send a request for specific TAP reports that may be needed to VF and AN to find.

c. Avian Influenza Recommendation –

ML: looking for input and haven't received info, may be a recommendation at next meeting

d. Whole herd conversion

KO: recommendation out of LC regarding origin still alive, just not addressed Harvey rule, last third of gestation?

AN: yes, once convert a herd to organic, no animals except last third of gestation, NOP response to 2004 recommendation issue 3, policy statement

HK: can this board have input on older decision

KO: yes, this board can have input, LC needs to decide whether they want/need to revisit and have input

**6. Policy Development Committee**

b. 606 criteria (commercial availability) and procedures – handled in joint committee w/ HC

RD: 4<sup>th</sup> review, very good action items; nearing 4<sup>th</sup> draft, still on target with document early in March; already discussed some of this under Harvey discussion under NOP Update earlier.

a. NOSB 101 guide

BJ: put together outline, VF is involved, tie into policies and procedures manual and revise with ED role, sift through that, hopefully by end of next week

VF: a power point presentation,

KO: some revisions to manual by meeting as action item?

BJ: point of discussion next EC and decide for meeting

## **7. Materials Committee**

### **a. Sunset review plan**

KO: Deferred materials list was sent out with EC agenda and minutes.

AN: Review of sufficiency reports should be handled by the responsible committees: Handling, Livestock, & Crops. Also, chairs of committees need to make sure they have appointed vice-chairs to ensure communication and work flow are handled in case.

### **b. New petitioned materials**

AN: Will be sending out new list and whatever reports available – if we can put on agenda, we will – if not, then we won't.

KO: All committees should send in who their vice-chairs are.

## **9. Handling Committee**

JW: Already discussed 606 (commercial availability) status under PDC

a. Sunset Review – 605 a (colors and flavors): submitted committee recommendation, 605 b will be wrapped up next week, and will also discuss sufficiency on chlorine and unbleached lecithin on 2/13/06 conference call. Deadline for posting recommendations is March 17<sup>th</sup>

KO: Not opposed to it being early – 2 weeks prior to April meeting is minimum. Glad colors and flavors is ready, need to weigh in on unbleached lecithin and bleached lecithin. If we think the reports are sufficient, then we can move forward. If we have issues, then we may have to defer.

b. Ag/non-ag recommendations (collaboration document with NOP)

VF: Nothing additional has happened – NOP compile historical info, but probably won't happen by April

VF: Pet food already reported under LC report, next meeting 2/14.

## **10. Crops Committee**

GD:

a. Sunset review – reviewing materials – will be able to complete by mid-March.

b. Compost recommendation – MB is supposed to give feedback.

c. Temporary research variance – RD is working on with GD

d. Hydroponics – Plan on some joint committee calls with CAC, not for April meeting.

## **11. Certification, Accreditation, and Compliance Committee**

AC: No calls, nothing pressing for this meeting.

a. Policy Items for Certifiers – emailed JW to do some of the work for certifier guidance on 606 criteria

b. Peer Review Program Recommendation - low priority, not really planning anything until next peer review.

**12. Other business** - all – DG not on everyone's email connection – make sure he is on everyone's list – that little "i" confused "j". His correct email is: [pnc@jps.net](mailto:pnc@jps.net). Please verify your email address for him!

## **13. Executive Director role** –did not get to discuss, ran out of time today

KO: VF and I will talk in next 2 weeks

BJ: Officers and VF could review and mull over – BJ not clear, VF gets direction from NOP, how does NOSB receive that? Look at duties in manual. Officers and VF set up conference call to discuss.

KO: Need to understand VF's role, help VF, too.

Adjourn: BJ, ML 2<sup>nd</sup>, all